



Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

City of Covington HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE BOARD December 7th, 2022, | 6:00 p.m.

*No hearing held in November 2022 City Hall Council Chambers, 2116 Stallings Street, Covington, GA Zoom Link: <u>https://us06web.zoom.us/j/88504118147</u> Dial in 1-646-558-8656 – Meeting ID: 885 0411 8147

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Ray Lustenberger (Chair) John Conklin Jim Maxwell Heather King Barbara Schmitt Monique Snow **STAFF PRESENT:**

Marc Beechuk (Director) Renee Criswell (Planner)

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Rosie Crawford Janet Goodman

- I. CALL TO ORDER/OPENING REMARKS: Chair called the meeting to order at 6:02 PM.
- II. DETERMINATION OF QUORUM: Quorum was present.
- III. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: Agenda approved by board.

IV. OLD BUSINESS:

 A. Approval of the October 5th, 2022, minutes. No hearing held on November 2nd, 2022. Monique Snow motioned to approve. John Conklin seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

V. NEW BUSINESS:

A. <u>COA# - PMAJ22-0001 thru 0009</u> <u>Request: Dorchester Plan Book Additions</u> Proposing the nine (9), prior plans, below:

- 1. Adam
- 2. Aspen
- 3. Griffin
- 4. Kingston
- 5. Kylie
- 6. Lincoln
- 7. Madison





Phone: (770) 385-2000

Fax: (770) 385-2060

Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

8. Oakmont
9. Somerset
Location: Dorchester Community
TMP# Various
Owner: Q. Dorchester Holdings, LLC (Quinn)
Applicant: Rivermoore Partners, LLC c/o Jason Gillis

Staff report:

P&D Director Beechuk presented to the board applicant's proposal requesting allowance of thirteen (13) new home designs and nine (9) secondary options into the approved Dorchester Place Plan book.

Director explained that the work on the Planned Unit Development begun in early 2000s having the concept of mixing style and product in an arrangement to maintain greenspace. He continued that the original concept of the community would be to incorporate styles that included Charleston, Colonial, Federal and Georgian with Victorian or Queen Anne and the homes were to have a size ranging from approximately 1600 to 3300 square feet. Following first homes completed in 2007-2008,

Site Conditions:

Director reported:

The first homes in the neighborhood were completed in 2007-2008 along Dorchester Dr. They were pulled out of the approved home design book, often featuring two stories with prominent front porches along with other architectural touches. A few homes began construction again in 2016 and another batch of homes was added to the approved book.

Styles have consistently evolved with the neighborhood being a mixture of 1, 1.5 & 2 story houses, mostly exhibiting craftsman veneers on standard house plans. The existing 30 homes were mostly built around the centralized lots with alley access, the remainder of the subdivision wraps around the perimeter of the overall property with approximately 25 more alley-fed lots. Director further commented, recently built homes featured the use of slabs on grade, instead of traditional masonry foundations, as featured in phase one. While some of the homes featured gable brackets and tapered columns, the effect was more of an attempt at decoration than being integral to the structure.

In summary, the use of masonry foundations would greatly enhance the appeal and feel of traditional construction and provide additional opportunities for key design elements, i.e., guardrails, etc. In addition, enhancing and/or exposing some of the architectural features that





Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

characterize the craftsman style would benefit all the homes that are being proposed for construction.

Staff recommendation:

Staff commented that they would like to see more variety, possibly limiting approved designs to no more than 4-6 uses and making sure when plans are reused, that they have different materials and textures with homes pulled up front, when feasible, using side entry, rear entry or detached garages (not just on the alley-fed lots) and featuring more prominent porches. The Design Code, presented by St. Bourke on June 23, 2017 should be required for future construction. Lastly, staff commented that wanted to see homes (especially if Craftsmen style) to be on raised crawlspaces mimicking historical design and being consistent with some of the original intent of the neighborhood. Staff recommended a **Denial** of the current applications, due to the proposed plans needing to make the recommended modifications below in order to meet design guidelines:

- 1. (Where applicable) Front porches shall have a minimum, masonry piers with heavyduty lattice or wood slat panels between piers. Masonry pavers on porch floors are also preferred, but not required.
- 2. (Where applicable) Railings on porches shall match the architectural stylings of each house and shall be painted to match the trim color.
- 3. Steps shall be 5'-0" wide minimum
- 4. All bathrooms on exterior walls shall have one transom window, minimum. All kitchens on exterior walls shall have one, minimum.
- 5. 4" crown mold minimum on 8" frieze on all four sides
- 6. Pediments (wood/synthetic) or brick detailing required over all windows and doors where roofline permits on fronts and sides facing the street
- 7. Queen Anne cornice returns with metal roofing are required
- 8. 10" skirt board w/drip cap required at bottom of all siding, shakes and/or board and batten
- 9. 8" columns minimum size for all decorative columns. All columns must have correct proportions
- 10. Chimney size 2'-8" x 3'-0", chimney shrouds required and shall be black
- 11. First floor windows shall be set at transom height and shall align with top of front door or front door transom
- 12. Front doors shall be 8'-0" tall, or standard height with a transom above
- 13. Board n Batton or panel shutters ; DRB must approve style, size, location.
- 14. Decorative garage windows ; carriage style doors
- 15. All houses shall be built so that the first finished floor elevation is not lower than 12" above curb directly in front of garage slabs included.





Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

Items to address generally:

- 1. The Design code as presented by St. Bourke on June 23, 2017 and attached herein shall be followed. Staff does recommend lowering the minimum size to 1700 sqft. as it would allow for compatibility with the existing stock and provide variety.
- 2. A limit placed on the number of times an individual unit from this design book may be used, staff proposes only up to 9 times (*this would mean a maximum of 81 homes, however 98 lots remain vacant*)
- 3. Porches shall be no less than 8' in depth for the entire length to allow for use as was historical design and custom
- 4. Provide a form and style for all proposed designs
- 5. Historical houses rarely have overlapping gables or gables inside of gables and none can be found in adjacent, contributing historical houses. This feature needs to be removed from all designs
- 6. Windows must be true divided light panes
- 7. Adam and Kingston plans are basically identical, one of them needs to be removed from the application
- 8. Applications should include more variety in regards to 1 story or 1.5 story options. Much of the surrounding historic neighborhood includes them as does the existing make-up of the neighborhood
- 9. Reuse of a design shall include differing architectural elements, textures and features
- 10. No plan shall sit adjacent to a house of the exact same plan
- 11. Many of the plans are wider than deep, but most of the lots are the opposite, limiting access for driveways to the rear. Plans should more closely work with the shape of the lots and accommodate rear, side or detached garages.
- 12. Historic homes in the area typically have crawl spaces. A reasonable effort shall be made by the builder where feasible to use topography, raise the first floor finished grade, utilize architectural treatments or a combination thereof to give the appearance of a crawlspace and raise the front porch

Applicant's presentation:

Applicant, Jason Gillis, presented to the board commenting that he believed the P&D Director mentioned the Madison being a part of the original designs, if so, could that plan be automatically approved and not require HPC approval. Director responded with his comment was the plan seemed to be a part of the originally approved Dorchester Plan book, but would have to confirm, would do so and get back with applicant and board regarding. Gillis continued to comment that crawl spaces were not proposed because crawl spaces, tend to have issues with moisture and rodents and continued that the original subdivision design was not planned out to have enough dirt to make crawlspaces work. Gillis further stated that it was his understanding that true divided light windows no longer meet the building energy code and felt the windows meeting an 8-foot door height would not fit and not familiar with that application.





Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

Public comments:

<u>Benny Hart</u> – 3111 Conyers St. – Commented in construction and that 8-foot doors were typical

<u>Blaney Carter</u> – 4182 Floyd St. – Commented she owned an historical home and had to pay extra to move dirt in to accommodate a crawl space and that the applicant could do the same to ensure the homes were built to historic standards;

<u>Terie Digby</u> – 3144 Academy Springs Cir. SE – Commented the lots in questions backed up to her property and had concerns for designs;

<u>Leigh Knight</u> – 4212 Brookhaven Dr. SE – Commented the Madison plan appeared to be the only plan that possibly would fit with original Dorchester plans and that the larger homes proposed would lend to parking issues;

<u>Michelle Snyder</u> – 3140 Academy Springs Cir. – Commented she, too, was concerned with the proposed homes not being within the historic standard of the district and neighborhood and was worried about the homes behind her being built outside of those standards;

<u>Getra Sanders</u> – 3188 Conyers St. – Commented some of the lots backed up to her property and the proposed plans were not of historic nature and the historic homes required a lot more design criteria to continue the standard within the district; <u>Mike Anderson</u> – 7122 Forest Dr. - Commented

Board Deliberation:

Conklin commented that the Dorchester Place community was within the historic district and any plans proposed needed to uphold those standards. He felt the plans proposed by the owner/applicant did not meet such standards and that the proposed sq.ft. was way to big for the neighborhood as well.

Maxwell commented that not having crawlspaces/elevation and true divided light windows items were non-negotiable.

Motion:

John Conklin motioned to request submitted by Rivermoore Partners, LLC to receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA), for the allowance of nine (9) new home designs into the approved Dorchester Place Plan book, was **denied** by the Historic Planning Commission for the following reasons:

- Submitted architectural plans did not meet all required and referenced Historic District and Dorchester Design Code guidelines requirements and that all guidelines must be meet, those referenced were not found on the nine proposed plans submitted, and would have been visually incompatible with existing buildings in the immediate neighborhood and did not adhere to vernacular building traditions of Covington;
- 2. Proposed house plan square footages are larger in scale than those existing within the Dorchester Community or on similarly sized lots in the Covington Historic District. They would thus be visually incompatible with existing buildings in the immediate neighborhood and would not adhere to vernacular building traditions of Covington.





Phone: (770) 385-2000

Fax: (770) 385-2060

Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

VI. DISCUSSION

A. <u>HPC Guideline revisions</u> STAFF/BOARD DISCUSSION:

Director asked board if they had any additional items regarding the HPC Guidelines, if not, the board could move forward on a motion regarding those revisions. Board had no further discussion and chair asked if there was a motion on the floor.

Jim Maxwell motioned to approve the HPC Guideline revisions and replace those previously in existence. Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Monique Snow motioned to adjourn. Heather King seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

VIII. CITIZENS PRESENT

Leigh & Lanier Knight – 4212 Brookhaven Dr., Danny Cook - 6132 Elliott St., John & Teri McCarthy – 3144 Academy Springs Cir., Zach Persley – Quinn Residential Jody & Jason Gillis – Rivermoore Partners Hope & Ryan Bass - 4302 Brookhaven Dr., Lynda Autry - 4104 Pemberton Dr., Karen Zahn – 5261 King St. SE, Cathy Rogers - 4116 Pemberton Dr., SE Bill & Cindy Samagalsky – 4207 Dorchester Dr., Danny & Vickie Floyd – 4213 Dorchester Dr., Scott Daniell – 75 Old Hickory Ln., Paige Kersh – 4191 Dorchester Dr., Liz & Richard Cobb – 4133 Brookhaven Dr., D. Stanford - ? Dean Cerri – 4275 Brookhaven Dr., Stephanie Collins – 4122 Pemberton Dr., SE Matt Thurman - 4122 Pemberton Dr., SE Cathy Ginn - 5183 Old Monticello St., Benny & Bobbi Hart – 3111 Conyers St., Callie Whitworth – 4104 Floyd St, Cham Stone – 4178 Conyers St., Blaney Boshan – 4182 Floyd St., Michelle Snyder - 3140 Academy Springs Cir., Brooke Wade - 4169 Dorchester Dr., Getra Sanders - 3188 Conyers St., Michael Anderson – 7122 Forest Dr., SE Marshall Ginn – 5183 Old Monticello St.



2194 Emory Street N.W. * P.O. Box 1527 Covington, Georgia 30015

Phone: (770) 385-2000 Fax: (770) 385-2060 Steve Horton - Mayor E.F. (Tres) Thomas, III - City Manager

Respectfully Submitted,

Renee' Criswell, City Planner Planning & Development

Ray Lustenberger, Chair Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) Board