

**CITY OF COVINGTON
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE BOARD
SPECIAL CALLED MEETING MINUTES**

March 13th, 2024
6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Ray Lustenberger
Barbara Schmitt
Rosie Crawford
Leigh Knight
LaKisha Clements
Janet Goodman
John Conklin
Monique Snow

STAFF PRESENT:

Judy Johnson, Director
Renee Criswell, Planner
Tracy Hernandez

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Heather King

STAFF ABSENT:

1. **OPENING REMARKS/ROLL CALL**

Chair called the meeting to order at 6:10 PM.

2. **DETERMINATION OF A QUORUM**

Chair stated a quorum was present.

3. **Approval of Minutes**

4. **NEW BUSINESS:**

A. **COA# PMOD23-0009**

Request: Clarification from board on previous motion from the August 2nd, 2023 hearing.

Applicant's originally approved request was for building upgrades, to include new windows, doors, soda blast masonry and replace cedar shakes. Applicant is requesting confirmation on the type of windows approved.

Location: 1150 Church St.

TMP#: C026 0017 006

Owner/Applicant: OXLT, LLC/Levie Maddox

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information along with applicant's below referenced request:

1. Board clarification for the motion made at the August 2nd, 2023 HPC hearing regarding the type of window design that was permissible for the building renovations at 1150 Church St.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant recommended approval of the confirmation for the proposed steel framed, powder coated, arched windows, originally presented to the HPC Board on August 2nd, 2023.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicant's representative, Jason Maddox, approached the board and explained that they wanted clarification on the approval of the proposed steel framed, powder coated black windows with top curvatures as the original window openings that were presented back on August 2nd, 2023.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

The board reviewed the originally proposed window designs from the August 2nd, 2023 HPC hearing and clarified that the windows proposed were approved.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Barbara Schmitt motioned to approve the clarification of the Board's originally approved window design from the August 2nd, 2023 HPC hearing. Monique Snow seconded. Motion passed unanimously (8-0)

B. COA# - PMOD24-0002

Request: Approval of the new, unauthorized renovations as listed below

- Raised back gabled Ell 4 feet at rear and 8 feet a front of Ell to accommodate the headroom needed to access the second floor
- Second floor attic now consists of 2 bedrooms, laundry room , full bath and existing family room
- Square footage of the house increased from 1,292 to 2,015. An approximate 723 sf.
- Front porch steps were widened from 4 feet to 8 feet using 6x6 posts and secured with concrete
- Porch's 4x4 posts were replaced with 10 feet high columns
- Railing was replaced and pickets were added to make railing height 36 inches
- Replaced rear deck with a 10x14 wood deck with railings, 2x2 pickets at a finished height of 42 inches with 2 stairs. Deck footings include 3 6x6 posts, submerged 24 inches into ground secured by poured concrete
- The 483 square foot garage has been framed out to include a bathroom, bedroom and living room.

Items approved with conditions at the January 5th, 2022 HPC

- Replace all windows with wood windows in either 2 over 2, 6 over 6 or 9 over 9 patterns (No use of glass block windows)
- Remove rear porch
- Replace front door with more modern design adding sidelights
- Replace siding maintaining the drop profile with lap siding

Location: 5191 Emory St. NW

TMP# C023 0004 002

Owner/Applicant: UAC Remodeling, Inc.

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information along with applicant's below referenced request:

1. Approval of unauthorized renovations, which included expansion of gable to access 2nd floor and enlarging square footage by 723 sf, widening front steps, adding

10-foot-high columns and pickets, rear deck replacement, and framing out the 483 square foot accessory structure (garage).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Due to the alterations and loss of historic materials, staff and consultant found little historic significance with the subject property and recommended approval with the following conditions:

Conditions

1. All windows shall have hoods and sills
2. Windows on the north and south facades shall align vertically on both floors
3. Additional windows, same size as existing, shall be added to the first-floor west façade to break up the continuous wall
4. Additional windows, same size as existing on first floor west façade, shall be added to the east façade of the second story
5. All porch columns shall be matching

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicants, Augustine Uches and Joyce Gardner, with UAC Remodeling approached and had some questions regarding staff consultant's recommendations for hoods and sills and the addition windows to west façade. Applicant stated there would be some issues with interior layout and window additions. Consultant Kerr approached the board and reiterate the hood to extend out a bit more on top with the hood and sill extending beyond the vertical brick mold at least an inch or two on each side on top as well to form a little roof and at bottom to assist with drawing water away from window and all columns should remain consistent.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

Monique Snow motioned for case item # PMOD24-0002 to be presented at the end of hearing in order for staff consultant and applicants to confer regarding proposed conditions and ensure all items were understood by both staff and applicants. Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motion passed unanimously (8-0).

Chair asked both consultant and applicant to address the board and confirm if the conditions to case #PMOD24-0002 had been discussed and resolved. Staff consultant Kerr relayed that after discussion with applicant's and due to the interior wiring and infrastructure, staff was recommending to modify the originally recommended condition of requiring the additional windows on the 2nd story east façade. As well as he would provide illustrations to the window hoods and sills for clarification.

Chair asked applicants if all was understood. Applicant stated all was understood and would reach back out to staff with any additional questions.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Monique Snow motioned to approve case # PMOD24-0002 with staff recommendations with exception of 2nd story east side window. LaKisha Clements 2nd the motion. Motion passed unanimously. (8-0)

- C. **COA Case #s- PMAJ23-0026, PMAJ23-0027, PMAJ23-0028, PMAJ23-0029, PMAJ23-0030, PMAJ23-0031 & PMAJ23-0032**

Request: Proposed architectural plan, *The Cadwell*, to be built on Lot #s 1, 5, 9, 23, 27, 31 & 44 within the Dorchester Place Community

Locations: 5150, 5174, 5196, 5372, 5394, 5389 & 5309 King St.

TMP#s: #C011A 001, #C011A 005, #C011A 009, #C011A 023 & #C011A 027, #C011A 031 & #C011A 044

Owner/Applicant: Q Dorchester Holdings, LLC / Rivermoore Partners, LLC

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

1. Approval of new residential construction within the Dorchester community for Lot # 1, 5, 9, 23, 27, 31 & 44 using architectural plan "The Cadwell".

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant find no issues with the placement of proposed "The Cadwell" plan on lot #s 1, 5, 9, 23, 27, 31 & 44 and recommend approval of request to HPC.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicant's representative, Andrew Galucki, presented a PowerPoint regarding the Archibald plan and lot placements. Cathy Laseter (Dorchester resident) made comment that the Dorchester residences still feel as though there are too many houses being proposed, but did relay that the current house plan presented looks much better than those originally approved. Vickie Floyd (Dorchester resident) made comments regarding the front facing garage not necessarily being allowed but was confirmed by City Attorney, Frank Turner, they are not recommended. She also had made comment regarding the number of homes within the historic district and the approximate percentage of front facing garages within the historic district and ask the board to make note of that. Daniel Parsons (Dorchester resident) approached the board and stated he just wanted to reiterate the comments from other residents regarding the number of houses being proposed and was not pleased with that number.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

John Conklin asked were there any thoughts given to side entry plans. John Howley responded yes, but due to the already approved plat, utilities and topography, side entry wouldn't be feasible for the presented lots.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Rosie Crawford motioned to approve with conditions below to approve COA Case #s PMAJ23-0026, PMAJ23-0027, PMAJ23-0028, PMAJ23-0029, PMAJ23-0030, PMAJ23-0031 & PMAJ23-0032 from nine to five lots. Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-2 with Leigh Knight recusing herself and Snow opposed) Conditions:

1. Remove lot numbers 5 (PMAJ23-0027) and 9 (PMAJ23-0028).

- D. COA# - PMAJ23-0034, PMAJ23-0035, PMAJ23-0081, PMAJ23-0022 PMAJ23-0037, PMAJ23-0038 & PMAJ23-0039.**
Request: Proposed architectural plan, *The Dustin*, to be built on Lot #s 13, 19, 24, 28, 35, 43, 49 within the Dorchester Place Community
Locations: 5212, 5342, 5378, 5398, 5371, 5313, & 5277 King St.,
TMP#: #C011A 013 , #C011A 019 , #C011A 024, #C011A 028 & #C011A 035, #C011A 043, #C011A 049
Owner/Applicant: Q Dorchester Holdings, LLC / Rivermoore Partners, LLC

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

1. Approval of new residential construction within the Dorchester community for Lot #s 13, 19, 24, 28, 35, 43 & 49 using architectural plan "The Dustin".

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant find no issues with the placement of proposed "The Dustin" plan on lot #s 13, 19, 24, 28, 35, 43, 49 and recommend approval of request to HPC.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Andrew Galucki gave a brief presentation regarding the proposed single-family construction of the Dustin plan. Cathy Laseter commented that she would like to see continuation of only 5 lot placements continue.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

Barbara Schmitt posed a question about the garage designs. Galucki responded the garages were in keeping with approved Historic District guidelines. Vickie Floyd brought to attention the address 4113 Pemberton (Lot #54) was advertised and missing from presentation. Staff confirmed that an originally submission came in for a repeat of eight times, after meeting with staff, applicant then dropped to a repeat of 7 with the address 4113 Pemberton for Lot #54 being removed.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Monique Snow motioned to approve COA Case #s PMAJ23-0034, PMAJ23-0035, PMAJ23-0081, PMAJ23-0022 PMAJ23-0037, PMAJ23-0038 & PMAJ23-0039 with lots as requested. John Conklin seconded. Motion failed. (4-2-1 with Goodman/Crawford/Clements/Schmitt opposing, Knight recusing herself and Snow/Conklin in favor).

Rosie Crawford motioned to approve with conditions COA Case #s PMAJ23-0034, PMAJ23-0035, PMAJ23-0081, PMAJ23-0022 PMAJ23-0037, PMAJ23-0038 & PMAJ23-0039 from nine to five lots. Janet Goodman seconded. Motion passes (4-2-1 with Goodman/Crawford/Conklin/Schmitt in favor, Knight recusing herself and Snow/Clements opposed)

Conditions:

1. Remove lot numbers 24 (PMAJ23-0081) and 43 (PMAJ23-0038)

- E. **COA# - PMAJ23-0060, PMAJ23-0061, PMAJ23-0019, PMAJ23-0062, PMAJ23-0063 & PMAJ23-0064**
Request: Proposed architectural plan, *The Silverstone*, to be built on Lot #s 4, 11, 20, 26, 32 & 45 within the Dorchester Place Community
Locations: 5168, 5204, 5352, 5390, 5385 & 5303 King St.
TMP#s: #C011A 004 , #C011A 011, #C011A 020 , #C011A 026 & #C011A 032, & #C011A 045
Owner/Applicant: Q Dorchester Holdings, LLC / Rivermoore Partners, LLC

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

1. Approval of new residential construction within the Dorchester community for Lot #s 4, 11, 20, 26, 32 & 45 using architectural plan "Silverstone".

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant find no issues with the placement of proposed "The Silverstone" plan on lots 4, 11, 20, 26, 32 & 45 and recommend approval of request to HPC.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Andrew Galucki approached the board and gave a brief presentation regarding the Silverstone plan modifications and six lot placements. Cathy Laseter commented to the board the Dorchester community appreciates the plan changes but still was not pleased with the number of lot placements for this plan. Bill Samagalsky inquired if the boards were running up and down or sideways. Galucki stated sideways. Samagalsky also made suggestion to move the garage to the side instead of front facing.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

Board had no questions or comments pertaining. Rosie Crawford asked Galucki if the plans were going to be looked back it for modifications. James Howley stated that modifications have been made extensively, but we do consider all changes brought forward.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Rosie Crawford motioned to approve with conditions COA Case #s - PMAJ23-0060, PMAJ23-0061, PMAJ23-0019, PMAJ23-0062, PMAJ23-0063 & PMAJ23-0064 from six to five lots. Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motion passes (5-1-2 with Crawford/Clements/Schmitt/Goodman/Conklin in favor, Knight recusing herself, and Snow opposed).

Conditions:

1. Remove lot #20 (PMAJ23-0019)

4. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

P&D Director Johnson announced there would be an HPC hearing held April 3rd and that Council would be holding another appreciation board banquet on April 25th, 2024 at 6 PM at Legion Field with invites to be sent out.

5. **ADJOURNMENT**

Rosie Crawford motioned to adjourn. Janet Goodman seconded. Motion carried unanimously. (8-0)

Respectfully submitted by,

Ray Lustenburger, Chair

Date

Renee Criswell, Sr. Planner

Date