CITY OF COVINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE BOARD SPECIAL CALLED MEETING MINUTES

April 3 , 2024

6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

STAFF PRESENT: Judy Johnson, Director

Judy Johnson, Director Renee Criswell, Planner

Ray Lustenberger Barbara Schmitt Rosie Crawford Leigh Knight Monique Snow Heather King

MEMBERS ABSENT:

John Conklin LaKisha Clements Janet Goodman **STAFF ABSENT:** Tracy Floyd

1. **OPENING REMARKS/ROLL CALL** Chair called the meeting to order at 6:10 PM.

2. DETERMINATION OF A QUORUM

Chair stated a quorum was present.

 Approval of March 13th, 2024 minutes to be approved at next scheduled hearing, Wednesday, May 1st, 2024

4. **NEW BUSINESS**:

A. <u>COA# PMAJ24-0002</u> Request: Demolition of building damaged by fire Location: 1140 Monticello St. TMP#: Co26 0018 002 Owner/Applicant: Sunbelco, Inc./Doug Tuller

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information along with applicant's below referenced request:

1. Demolition of building due to structural damage caused by fire.

Criswell presented that the Circa 1896 building had sustained structural damage from a fire that occurred back in fall of 2023. Per the structural engineering report, the building underwent mass structural damage that consumed the whole roofing structure, the interior masonry walls remained intact, but suffered damage. Two load bearing walls remained standing, but were currently unsupported by any structure.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Due to submitted engineering data, Staff and consultant recommended approval of COA Case # PMAJ24-0002, for requested demolition, with the staff recommended conditions.

Conditions:

- 1. Obtain and submit an asbestos abatement letter with submittal of demolition permit.
- 2. Offer remaining demolition materials for recycling and/or reclamation
- 3. Ensure proper pedestrian and traffic safety has been undertaken before demo.
- 4. Ensure proper debris containment is in place before demo.
- 5. Any proposed new construction should take into account the height, scale and mass of the previous historic asset.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicant, Doug Tuller, approached the board and reiterated staff's findings as well as gave an overview of the engineering report. Reported that while the fire was mainly in the attack area, the fire department reported roughly 3 million gallons of water was doused upon the building to extinguish the flames causing the ceiling and floors to collapse. Would like to rebuild as it was, but currently have no known cost without demoing the building to assess.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

None

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Barabra Schmitt motioned to approve COA Case # PMAJ24-0002, for requested demo, with staff recommended conditions.

Conditions

- 1. Obtain and submit an asbestos abatement letter with submittal of demolition permit.
- 2. Offer remaining demolition materials for recycling and/or reclamation
- 3. Ensure proper pedestrian and traffic safety has been undertaken before demo.
- 4. Ensure proper debris containment is in place before demo.
- 5. Any proposed new construction should take into account the height, scale and mass of the previous historic asset.

Rosie Crawford seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-0)

B. <u>COA# - PMOD24-0004</u>

<u>Request:</u> Porch enclosure for additional closet space and construct a 200-sf storage <u>shed</u>

Location: 5188 Hillcrest Dr. TMP# Co23 0006 008 Owner/Applicant: Juan Guardado

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information along with applicant's below referenced request:

1. Enclose the 7' x 11' (77) square foot side porch in order to construct additional closet space for the primary structure.

2. Construct a 10' x 20' (200) square foot storage shed/accessory structure to the rear of the home in order to store lawn and yard equipment

Criswell presented that the home was an early South Georgia ranch style home built in 1957 and was a noncontributing source of Covington's North Historic District. Given the home was noncontributing, a porch enclosure would be feasible as long as solid materials used did not detract from the façade. Further, outbuildings should be constructed towards the rear of the property, behind the primary and compliment that of the existing.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the applicants requests for COA Case# PMOD24-0004 regarding porch enclosure and storage shed be approved with the conditions below:

Conditions

- 1. Materials used must be consistent with that of the primary having lap siding, double hung windows with any paint applied remaining in the color scheme of the existing.
- 2. Any and all required permits must be pulled and approved prior to construction.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicant's daughter, Jennifer Guardado, presented to the board that the porch enclosure would be used for additional closet space and that the shed would help store all lawn equipment.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

Knight asked to confirm rear position of shed and would the porch steps be removed. Applicant reiterated shed to be at rear of home and steps to be removed.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Rosie Crawford motioned to approve COA Case #PMOD24-0004, for porch enclosure and rear accessory storage shed, with staff recommended conditions.

Conditions:

- 1. Materials used must be consistent with that of the primary having lap siding, double hung windows with any paint applied remaining in the color scheme of the existing.
- 2. Any and all required permits must be pulled and approved prior to construction.

Leigh Knight seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-0)

C. COA Case # PMOD24-0003 Request: Replace existing windows and doors Locations: 1126 & 1128 Floyd St. TMP#: C020 0011 001 Owner/Applicant: Floyd Pace St., LLC/Kharmin Beam

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

- 1. Remove and replace the existing three set windows with 43" x 79" storefront windows (one set to allow for opening/closing).
- 2. Replace existing single window with a $36'' \times 67''$ storefront window.
- 3. Remove existing single wooden door with a 42" x 83" storefront door.
- 4. Remove masonry work necessary to accommodate a new 88" x 84" open space, replacing existing stoop with an approved stoop incorporating an outward swinging, double door.
- 5. Replace the two single windows on Elm Street with bronze, flush glass framed windows

Criswell presented the current structure as well as the proposed window and door samples along with neighboring structure existing windows and doors.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant found that the plans were compatible with that of the district and recommended that the applicant's request for COA Case # PMOD24-0003 for the replacement and renovation to the existing windows and doors along the façade of 1126 & 1128 Floyd and along the façade of Elm Street be approved with the following conditions:

Conditions:

1. Any and all required permits must be submitted and approved, prior to construction

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicant presented to the board and further explained the proposed request in depth regarding the changes to Floyd and Elm Street facades regarding the window and door replacements and the minimal removal of masonry pertaining to the door and stoop replacement. Applicant also relayed that the new tenant would be MaddLuLu's Coffee Shop, which currently is in operation in Porterdale. The new tenant inquired about changing the lighting fixtures outside. Chair referred to Staff at which time staff responded a COA would need submitting; however, could be done administratively with the board in agreement.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

King asked would there be outdoor seating. Applicant responded that is intention with window orders. Knight inquired about the masonry for the door, applicant relayed contractor info and that the coloring to be close to the same.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Monique Snow motioned to approve COA Case #PMOD24-0003, for the request of replacement and renovation to the existing windows and doors along the façade of 1126 & 1128 Floyd and along the façade of Elm Street, with staff recommended conditions.

Conditions

1. Any and all required permits must be submitted and approved, prior to construction

Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-0)

D. COA Case # PMAJ24-0001

Request: Demo existing carport, extend pad 3 feet to rear in order to construct a new twocar garage, connected by enclosed breezeway, with finished second story. Locations: 3183 Conyers St. TMP#: C010 0008 005 Owner/Applicant: Doug and Kirsten Brames

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

1. Demo existing carport & garage to add a 2-story garage attached to existing primary structure via enclosed corridor.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant found that the plans were compatible with that of the district and recommended that the applicant's request for COA Case # PMAJ24-0001 for the demo of existing garage in order to construct a new two-car garage connected by enclosed corridor be approved with the following conditions:

Conditions:

- 1. Siding must Hardie Lap Siding as primary
- 2. Windows to be 6 over 6 in keeping consistency with the existing side elevations.
- 3. Garage door must be of that of a carriage style
- 4. Any and all required permits must be submitted and approved, prior to construction.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicant presented to the board and further explained the request was to allow more space for family/children when visiting as well as make the garage a much more appealing structure than the existing addition.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

Knight commented that the home has been through several transformations and would be happy to see the garage remodeled to match the existing streetscape.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Heather King motioned to approve COA Case # PMAJ24-0001, for the demo of existing carport in order to construct a 2-story garage attached to existing primary structure via enclosed corridor, with staff recommended conditions.

Conditions:

- 1. Siding must Hardie Lap Siding as primary
- 2. Windows to be 6 over 6 in keeping consistency with the existing side elevations.
- 3. Garage door must be of that of a carriage style
- 4. Any and all required permits must be submitted and approved, prior to construction.

Monique Snow seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-0)

E. COA Case # PMOD24-0005

Request: Demo existing roof in order to construct a 2nd story addition along with rear fence replacement and front installation.

Locations: 2193 Conyers St. TMP#: C019 0002 009 Owner/Applicant: Mike and Adriana Zimmerman

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

- 1. Demo portion of existing roof in order to add a second story addition
- 2. Installation of new, front aluminum welded, black fence with replacement of rear, wood fencing adding metal posts every 6 inches.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant found that the plans were compatible with that of the district and recommended that the applicant's request for COA Case # PMOD24-0005 for the demolition of a portion of the existing roof in order to add a second-story addition along with installation of a front and replacement of rear fencing be approved with the following conditions:

Conditions:

- 1. Addition shall be constructed as presented unless otherwise approved by the HPC.
- 2. New windows shall match existing windows and include hoods and sills.
- 3. Cladding materials and roofing materials match existing materials.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicants presented to the board proposed plans and elevations. Applicant explained that the request for addition was to assist with space expansion for their children's bedrooms as well as request for fencing to allow additional space for family dog.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

King inquired about access to attic space and was there any means to use the attic space for use. Applicant stated really not enough room to have full size bedrooms in that space. Why they want to extend the roofline for additional spacing. As well as there have been so many additions to the roofline the pitch does not allow.

King and Knight stated that the submitted elevations were difficult to determine how the height would affect the existing and surrounding.

Knight inquired to consultant Kerr regarding elevations. Kerr stated that the house was originally believed to be a Georgian Cottage with several changes over the years one being a second gabled extension at front of house. Basically, the house was a one story with a hipped roof and wrapped porch. Today the gables are two projection gables with clapboard. Applicant proposes shingles instead of clapboard, which he deemed ok. The renovations do maintain the basic Georgian Cottage style and does add the additional space. Would have been ideal to maintain hipped roof with chimneys, but the age of brick on chimneys make it difficult to sustain the chimneys. Revision does add a lot of mass, but going up appears to be the best solution. Because of configuration of house, a rear addition would be extremely difficult.

Applicant stated that the height would not exceed 34 feet. Several board members had questions and concerns regarding the height and the current elevations not being sufficient to clarify the proposal.

The applicant asked the board instead of moving forward with a motion and vote, could they withdraw their request, without prejudice, in order to resubmit revised elevations to better explain proposed as well as height proposals.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Leigh Knight motioned to allow the applicant to withdraw request, without prejudice, for COA Case # PMOD24-0005, for the request of a second story addition, in order to revise renderings and resubmit at a later date.

Monique Snow seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-0).

F. COA Case #s PMAJ23-0018, PMAJ23-0082, PMAJ23-0020, PMSJ23-0021, PMSJ23-0036, PMSJ23-0023, and PMAJ23-0025

Request: Construct new single-family residential homes with proposed architectural plan, The Archibald, on Lot #s 3, 10, 14, 22, 30, 34, and 46.

Locations: 5162, 5200, 5218, 5366, 5393, 5377, and 5297 King St. TMP#: #C011A 003, #C011A 010, #C011A 014, #C011A 022, #C011A 030, #C011A 034, & #C011A 046

Owner/Applicant: Q. Dorchester Holdings, LLC/Rivermoore Partners, LLC

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

1. Request approval for new single- family construction for "The Archibald" plan to be constructed on lot #s 3, 10, 14, 22, 30, 34, & 46

Criswell presented both previous and modified elevations of the proposed architectural plan as well as presented lot placement location proposals.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff and consultant found that the plan, as presented, were compatible with that of the district and recommended that the applicant's request for COA Case #s PMAJ23-0018, PMAJ23-0082, PMAJ23-0020, PMSJ23-0021, PMSJ23-0036, PMSJ23-0023, and PMAJ23-0025 for new single-family residential construction of the Archibald plan on lot #s 3, 10, 14, 22, 30, 34, and 46 be approved.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Before applicant approached board, Director Johnson reiterated to board, for those that were not present at the April 1st, 2024 Council, Council's decision regarding the appeal of the Lakewood and that Council did overturn HPCs decision with a tentative agreement, based on how things move forward, agreeing to allow 7 repeats of same plan and a tentative agreement that the three that was also restricted by this board to no more than 5 at the last HPC are under appeal as well as this proposal. An agreement was made that if they were to obtain 7 repeats, no more, then an agreement to drop the law suit would be made. Council did amend their number to the 7 repeats. The question brought before the board tonight is whether the plan meets the historic district design guidelines.

With Director Johnson's comments complete, applicant then approached and presented a PowerPoint to the board reflecting the proposed Archibald plan elevations for the new single-family construction on proposed lots.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

None presented.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Monique Snow motioned to approved COA Case #s PMAJ23-0018, PMAJ23-0082, PMAJ23-0020, PMSJ23-0021, PMSJ23-0036, PMSJ23-0023, and PMAJ23-0025, for the new single-family construction of the Archibald plan, on proposed lot #s 3, 10, 14, 22, 30, 34, & 46 within the Dorchester Place Community.

Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motioned passed 4-0 with Knight abstaining.

4. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Director Johnson mentioned the upcoming City Board Banquet that was to be held on Thursday, April 25^{th} , 2024 from 6 – 8 PM at Legion Field.

5. **ADJOURNMENT**

Rosie Crawford motioned to adjourn. Monique Snow seconded. Motion passed unanimously (5-0).

Respectfully submitted by,

Ray Lustenburger, Chair

Date

Renee Criswell, Sr. Planner

Date