

**CITY OF COVINGTON
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE BOARD
SPECIAL CALLED MEETING MINUTES**

May 1st, 2024
6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Ray Lustenberger
Barbara Schmitt
Rosie Crawford
Leigh Knight
Monique Snow
Heather King
LaKisha Clements

STAFF PRESENT:

Judy Johnson, Director
Renee Criswell, Planner

MEMBERS ABSENT:

John Conklin
Janet Goodman

STAFF ABSENT:

1. **OPENING REMARKS/ROLL CALL**

Chair called the meeting to order at 6:10 PM.

2. **DETERMINATION OF A QUORUM**

Chair stated a quorum was present.

3. **Approval of February 7th and March 13th, 2024 minutes**

Monique Snow motioned to approve. Rosie Crawford seconded. Motion passed unanimously (7-0)

4. **NEW BUSINESS:**

A. **COA# PMINOR24-0001**

Request: Window replacement, removal and replacement of porch railing and stairs, removal of deteriorated roof spindles/railings

Location: 3136 Monticello St.

TMP#: C018 0003 002

Owner/Applicant: William and Leah Kemp

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information along with applicant's below referenced request:

1. To replace the existing windows, ranging from 6 over 6, 12-pane, double-hung casement, one over one, with one over one, energy efficient, double hung vertical open windows as well as replacement of one double hung casement window with same energy efficient double hung casement. Additional requests are to replace the damaged porch flooring, rails and stairs along with removal of deteriorated roof spindle railing.

Criswell gave background regarding the history of the home being constructed in 1949 being a one-story, early colonial revival inspired ranch style home with side gabled shingle covered roof, front facing gable near entrance, front gabled projection having

dual chimneys. Criswell further explained there had been several modifications to the home, including one double-hung, outward swinging casement window.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended approval of COA Case #PMINOR24-0001 for both window replacement and repair/replacement of all deteriorating items presented to the board for approval.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project. Applicants, William and Leah Kemp gave a brief overview to the board that due to deterioration and damage the windows and spindle/railing repairs were in dire need of replacement and repairs and was hoping to replace the windows with those similar to neighboring properties.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

King asked if the applicants were proposing to replace or completely take off the roof balustrade. Applicants said that given the amount of damage and cost to try and replace, etc., they were going to just remove the roofing balustrade entirely as they are not salvageable. However, the bottom porch balustrades were going to be replaced.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Heather King motioned to approved COA Case #PMINOR24-0001 for both window replacement and repair/replacement of all deteriorating items, as presented to the board. Monique Snow seconded. Motion passed unanimously (7-0)

B. **COA# - PMOD24-0005**

Request: Demo portion of existing roof in order to add a second story addition

Location: 2193 Conyers St.

TMP# C019 0002 009

Owner/Applicant: Michael and Adriana Zimmerman

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information along with applicant's below referenced request:

1. Demolition of roof in order to construct a new second story addition, which would include removing the chimneys, extending the roof and adding gable ends, adding a central window, cladding the front facing gables with wooden shingles and balustrade across the front porch.
2. Rear fence replacement and front installation.

Criswell presented a PowerPoint referencing the applicant's revised architectural renderings notating approximate proposed height, designs etc.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the applicants requests for COA Case# PMOD24-0005 be approved with the following conditions:

Conditions:

1. The main mass of the house shall have a hipped roof.
2. The front facing gables shall mimic the existing gables in pitch and distance from the ridge of the hipped roof at the point of intersection.
3. Any existing architectural details shall be preserved (i.e. corner capitals, entablature cornice, eave returns, etc.)
4. New windows match existing windows and include hoods and sills
5. Cladding materials and roofing materials match existing materials
6. Addition shall be constructed, as presented, unless otherwise approved by the HPC
7. Prior to construction, any all required building and fence permits be submitted and approved.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair asked for public comments in favor or opposition of the proposed project.

Applicants went over the requested renderings and height and depth variations of those presented reiterating the change in height would be from existing 30 feet to proposed 31 feet 6 inches. Also, board had requested showing the accessory structure height against the proposed.

Levie Maddox commented that the applicants are the type of residences Covington needed and it didn't seem right to not allow them to expand for the benefit of their family.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

Chair asked what was the main goal for the expansion. Applicant stated to give their two children bedroom space. Chair asked why couldn't the established attic space be used. Applicants responded that the space in that area would not accommodate the desired two bedrooms and a bathroom. We can't go out the sides because of setback limits; therefore, only way to expand is up. Knight if you have to remove the roof anyway can you not keep original pitch? Applicant, we would connect to rear roofline and go up. Shingles to match with roof in back to stay. King stated she just was not on board with the current renderings just appeared three levels of height. King would like to see the roof match those of neighboring homes with rendering changes brought back.

Crawford stated we requested renderings last hearing not sure why requesting additional for same conversation. Applicant stated the request previously was for height and for the renderings to have more clarity and show depth, but agreed they could once again bring other options back to the board. King continued to state that she just had issues with the historic feel and scale of the home. Knight asked consultant Kerr if he felt there were any historical homes in the area like the proposed. Kerr stated that could not be a yes or no due to a lot of homes in the area having been modified. There are some that could be called similar but difficult to tell what original configuration were on homes in comparison. So, no complete answer on one that was done exactly like the proposed. The subject home has had modifications done as well. King had concerns with the proposed gables in that they seemed gratuitous. Applicant stated they could make changes of the gable pitch and lower. Kerr recommended that the gables remain the same size, if possible, as those on original structure. Applicant asked could they try to adjust this meeting instead of waiting a month. Director Johnson stated there would be a special called meeting on May 8th, 2024 that additional requested renderings could be brought back and still

remain within the ordinance required 45-day period (16.52.300) with the fencing request moving forward at the current hearing, should the board wish to.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

Heather King motioned to approve the request for fence replacement and installation, under COA Case #PMOD24-0005. Barbara Schmitt seconded. Motion passed unanimously (7-0).

Heather king motioned to deny the request for second story addition under COA Case #PMOD24-0005. Monique Snow seconded. Motion failed for lack of votes.

Monique Snow motioned to modify the motion for the request for a second story edition, under COA Case #PMOD24, to allow the applicant to modify/revise the submitted plans to be brought back before the board at the May 8th, 2024 Special Called Hearing. LaKisha Clements seconded. Motion passed unanimously (7-0)

C. COA Case # PMOD24-0007

Request: Door and window replacement/installation

Locations: 1140 Reynolds St.

TMP#: C026 0018 007

Owner/Applicant: OXLT/LLC / Levie Maddox

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Renee Criswell presented to the board parcel and zoning information, architectural plan elevation and changes, along with applicant's request to allow for below referenced request:

1. Renovations to existing structure; replace windows and doors; Re-open enclosed window spaces to install /replace new windows.

Criswell presented a PowerPoint showing the requested changes and samples of proposed windows/doors. Stated the building was constructed circa 1868 and was possibly one of the first buildings in Covington to have an elevator.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended denial of the initially proposed window and door replacement under COA Case # PMOD24-0007, but would be inclined to recommend approval to HPC with the following conditions:

Conditions:

1. The windows shall be one over one single or double hung sashes and retain granite sills.
2. The doors and sidelights shall have one panel and single light (or solid glass).
3. Prior to construction, any and all required building permits must be submitted and approved.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Applicant approached the board stating the originally proposed windows and doors were those that were the same as approved for his other property at "The Little

Store” and wanted to create a different type of history. However, prior to the hearing, he had a conversation with city consultant Kerr and was in agreement with staff conditions for using the one over one or double hung sashes and retaining the granite sills along with the doors and sidelights having one panel and single light. That consultant’s recommendation would also save them money and present a safer option for the second floor.

HPC BOARD MEMBERS QUESTIONS & COMMENTS:

King asked staff to confirm that staff and consultant initially recommended denial due to the originally proposed windows and doors, but if staffs recommended conditions are followed, staff would be recommending approval with conditions. Criswell confirmed that was correct.

DELIBERATION AND MOTION:

LaKisha Clements motioned to approve with staff conditions the request for window and door replacements under COA Case #PMOD24-0007. Rosie Crawford seconded. Motion passed unanimously (7-0)

4. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None

5. **ADJOURNMENT**

Rosie Crawford motioned to adjourn. LaKisha Clements seconded. Motion passed unanimously (7-0).

Respectfully submitted by,

Ray Lustenburger, Chair

Date

Renee Criswell, Sr. Planner

Date